



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg The Children, Young People and Education Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 12 Mawrth 2015  
Thursday, 12 March 2015**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

[Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions](#)

[Ymchwiliad i Waith Athrawon Cyflenwi—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1  
Inquiry into Supply Teaching—Evidence Session 1](#)

[Papurau i'w Nodi  
Papers to note](#)

[Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42\(ix\) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o Weddill y  
Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order 17.42\(ix\) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Remainder  
of the Meeting](#)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol  
Committee members in attendance**

Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
Paul Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (yn dirprwyo ar ran Angela Burns) Welsh Conservatives (substitute for Angela Burns)
Suzy Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Bethan Jenkins	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Ann Jones	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Chair of the Committee)
Lynne Neagle	Llafur Labour
David Rees	Llafur Labour
Aled Roberts	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats

**Eraill yn bresennol  
Others in attendance**

Catherine Evans	Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi, Estyn Her Majesty's Inspector, Estyn
Meilyr Rowlands	Cyfarwyddwr Strategol, Estyn Strategic Director, Estyn

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol  
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Sarah Bartlett	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Sian Hughes	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Gareth Rogers	Clerc Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:31.  
The meeting began at 09:31.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Ann Jones:** Good morning, everybody. Welcome to the Children, Young People and Education Committee. Just the usual housekeeping rules. Can I ask, if you've got your mobile phones on, can you just make sure they're on silent, so that they don't interfere with the proceedings of the committee? We're not expecting the fire alarm to operate. If it does, we'll take our instructions from the ushers, but if we're able to get out from this side of the building, the Pierhead is the assembly point. We operate bilingually, as you know—I think you've been to committee, anyway, before, so you know we operate bilingually.

[2] We've had apologies this morning from Simon Thomas, John Griffiths and Angela Burns; Paul Davies is substituting for Angela Burns, so it's nice to see you again. We're going to start our inquiry into supply teaching and this is our first public evidence session. Do Members wish to declare any interests that they think may be relevant? Aled.

[3] **Aled Roberts:** Ie, dylwn i ddatgan fy mod i'n dal i fod yn llywodraethwr ysgol. **Aled Roberts:** Yes. I should declare that I'm still a school governor.

[4] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Diolch. Thank you.

09:32

### **Ymchwiliad i Waith Athrawon Cyflenwi—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1 Inquiry into Supply Teaching—Evidence Session 1**

[5] **Ann Jones:** Right. So, we go into our supply teaching inquiry. Our first evidence session is with Estyn. We're delighted to have Estyn back with us; it was only a fortnight ago, I think, you were with us. Since then, you've been appointed to replace Ann, so we're delighted that you've got that position and we look forward to carrying on working with you. I'm sure that we'll see you on several occasions between now and the dissolution of this Assembly, anyway.

[6] **Mr Rowlands:** Thank you very much.

[7] **Ann Jones:** No, that's good. Thank you. You are joined today by Catherine Evans, who is an inspector.

[8] **Ms Evans:** Yes.

[9] **Ann Jones:** That's great. Thanks, both, very much for that and thanks for your evidence paper. Members have seen that and read it and we've got some areas of questioning, as you know. So, the first set is around the use of supply teachers, and that's Aled and David. So, Aled, do you want to start?

[10] **Aled Roberts:** Diolch. Rwyf i jest eisiau gofyn, yn y lle cyntaf: mae'ch tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig chi ynglŷn â'r defnydd o athrawon cyflenwi yn dweud mai dim ond lleiafrif o ysgolion sydd yn gweithredu polisi absenoldeb athrawon mewn ffordd gadarn. Pam mae yna ddiffyg o ran gweithredu'r polisïau yna yn y lle cyntaf? **Aled Roberts:** Thank you. I just wanted to ask, in the first place: your written evidence about the use of supply teachers states that only a minority of schools operate an absence policy for teachers in a robust way. Why is there a lack in terms of implementing that policy in the first place?

[11] **Mr Rowlands:** Bore da, bawb. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn werth gosod yr holl faes yma yn y cyd-destun ehangach, a'r cyd-destun hwnnw ydy: fel nifer o bethau mewn addysg, mae hyn yn amrywio llawer o ysgol i ysgol. Mae yna arfer dda mewn rhai ysgolion ac arfer sydd ddim crystal mewn ysgolion eraill. Un o'r prif ffactorau ydy arweinyddiaeth yr ysgol. Lle mae arweinyddiaeth yn dda, nid yw'n gymaint o broblem ag yw e mewn ysgolion eraill. Fedrwyd chi ddeall pam mae absenoldeb athrawon yn medru bod yn fwy o broblem mewn ysgol lle nad yw'r arweinyddiaeth a'r rheolaeth gystal. Yn y math yna o ysgol, gall athrawon fod dan fwy o bwysau, gan golli mwy o amser. Mae'n bosib nad yw'r plant yn **Mr Rowlands:** Good morning, all. I think it's worth putting this whole area in its broader context, and that context is: as with a number of things in education, this varies a great deal from school to school. There is good practice in some schools and practice that is not as good in others. One of the main factors is school leadership. Where leadership is strong, this isn't such a problem as it is in other schools. You can understand why teacher absence is more of a problem in schools where the leadership and management isn't as good. In that kind of school, teachers can be under more pressure, and they are absent more often. It may be that the children aren't as well behaved and it's

ymddwyn cystal, ac mae hefyd yn bosib nad yw rhai o'r athrawon llanw'n barod i fynd i'r ysgolion yna. Felly, mae'n werth gwneud y pwynt yna: bod yr ysgolion sydd â rheolaeth gadarn yn medru delio gydag absenoldeb athrawon llawer yn well na'r rheini lle nad yw'r arweinyddiaeth gystal.

[12] Yn ogystal, y patrwm rŷm ni'n ei weld yw, lle bo'r arweinyddiaeth yn fwyaf cadarn mewn ysgolion, maen nhw'n tueddu i ddefnyddio eu hathrawon a'u cynorthwywyr llanw eu hunain. Maen nhw'n penodi'r bobl yma eu hunain ac mae hynny hefyd yn medru gwneud delio ag absenoldeb llawer iawn yn haws. Mae e'n datrys dwy brif broblem o ran delio ag absenoldeb, sef os ydych chi'n defnyddio athrawon llanw sydd ddim yn gyfarwydd â'r ysgol, mae yna ddiffyg dilyniant. Nid ydyn nhw'n gyfarwydd â'r ysgol. Nid ydyn nhw'n gyfarwydd â'r plant. Nid ydyn nhw wedi medru adeiladu perthynas dda. Nid ydyn nhw wedi medru gwybod beth yw anghenion addysgol y plant. Nid ydyn nhw hyd yn oed yn gwybod sut mae'r ysgol wedi ei gosod allan yn ffisegol, fel petai. Felly, mae yna lot o broblemau. Os ydych chi hefyd yn penodi'ch athrawon a'ch cynorthwywyr llanw eich hun, mae hynny'n golygu bod y bobl hynny yn cael hyfforddiant hefyd. Dyna un o'r problemau eraill gyda staff llanw sy'n dod o'r tu allan i'r ysgol.

[13] Felly, rwy'n credu ei bod yn werth gosod y cyd-destun cyffredinol yna i ddechrau. Ond, i ateb eich cwestiwn, mae e'n aml iawn yn dod i lawr i weledigaeth yr arweinwyr a pha mor gadarn ydyn nhw.

[14] **Aled Roberts:** A lle nad yw'r arweinyddiaeth yn gadarn, mae'n ymddangos fod yna gryn dipyn o gymhlethdod o ran lle mae'r cyfrifoldeb o ran adnoddau dynol—ai gyda'r awdurdod lleol ydy o neu'r consortia. Mae'n ymddangos bod yna wahaniaeth ar draws Cymru ynglŷn â lle yn union mae'r adrannau adnoddau dynol yna yn eistedd. A ydy hynny wedi creu sefyllfa sy'n gwaethygu, neu a ydym ni'n edrych ar batrwm sydd wedi bodoli am rai blynyddoedd?

[15] **Mr Rowlands:** Rydym ni yn mynd trwy gyfnod o newid, wrth gwrs, gyda sefydlu'r consortia. Fel rydych chi'n gwybod, mae consortia mewn gwahanol lefydd ar hyn o

also possible that some supply teachers aren't willing to work in those schools. So, it's worth making that point: that the schools that have robust management in place can deal with teacher absences far more effectively than schools that don't have that strong leadership in place.

In addition, the pattern that we see is that where the leadership is strongest in schools, they tend to use their own supply teachers and assistants. They appoint these people themselves and that can also make dealing with absence far easier. It solves two major problems in dealing with absence, namely, if you use supply teachers who aren't familiar with the school, then there is a problem with continuity. They aren't familiar with the school. They aren't familiar with the children. They haven't been able to build good relationships. They won't have been able to learn about the educational needs of the children. They don't even know how the school is laid out physically, as it were. So, there are a lot of problems. If you also appoint your own supply teachers and assistants, then that means that those people can be given training, too. That's one of the other problems with supply staff who are external to the school.

So, I do think it's worth putting it in that general context first of all. But, to answer your question, it very often does come down to the vision of the leaders and to the strength of their leadership.

**Aled Roberts:** And where that leadership isn't robust, it appears that there's quite a bit of complexity in terms of where the responsibility lies for human resources—whether it lies with the local authority or with the consortia. It appears that there is a variation across Wales about where those HR departments actually sit. Has that created a situation that's deteriorating, or are we looking at a pattern that has existed for some years?

**Mr Rowlands:** We are going through a period of change, of course, with the establishment of the consortia. As you know, consortia are at different stages at present, in

bryd, o ran datblygu gwasanaethau adnoddau dynol ar y cyd. Mae rhai consortia yn gweithio'n fwy gyda'i gilydd, efallai, nag eraill. Y bwriad ydy symud mwy, o beth rwy'n ei ddeall, o'r gwaith adnoddau dynol i'r consortia o awdurdodau lleol, fel bod yna fwy o gysondeb o ran adnoddau dynol ar draws y consortia.

[16] **Ms Evans:** A gaf i jest ddod i mewn yn fan yna? Pan wnaethom ni'r gwaith maes ar gyfer yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd ym Medi 2013, beth welon ni yr adeg hynny oedd bod yna ambell i awdurdod yn dal i weithredu rhyw fath o *pool* o athrawon cyflenwi. Felly, roedd gyda nhw restr o bobl ac wedyn roedd yr ysgolion yn gallu dewis. Mewn un awdurdod, er enghraifft, rhestr bapur oedd hi. Roedd yr ysgol yn derbyn copi o bwyr oedd ar gael ar gyfer cyflenwi ac wedyn yn gallu dewis o'r bobl hynny. Mewn rhai awdurdodau, wedyn, roedden nhw'n defnyddio cwmnïau i weithredu rhestr o athrawon cyflenwi ar-lein, felly yn mynd trwy rywbeth fel *Eteach*, neu rywbeth fel yna, ac wedyn byddai ysgolion yn gallu cysylltu trwy hynny. Wedyn, gwelon ni mewn rhai awdurdodau nad oedd unrhyw beth penodol yn bodoli, ac felly roedd ysgolion yn tueddu i gysylltu'n uniongyrchol â rhyw fath o asiantaeth yr oedden nhw wedi magu perthynas â hi o ran y gwaith.

[17] Hefyd, pan wnaethom ni'r gwaith ymchwil, mewn ychydig o ysgolion—ddim pob un, ond ychydig o'r ysgolion y gwnaethom ni ymweld â nhw—beth ddywedon nhw oedd, oherwydd y newidiadau sy'n digwydd ar lefel awdurdodau lleol, fod y cyngor a'r arweiniad maen nhw wedi ei gael gan adrannau rheoli pobl y cyngor yn amrywiol, ac oherwydd bod llai o bobl yn gwneud y rolau yna, mae hynny wedi effeithio ar faint o arweiniad a chyngor maen nhw'n gallu ei gael pan mae'n dod i reoli staff ac athrawon cyflenwi.

[18] **Aled Roberts:** Beth sy'n fy mhryderu i yw ein bod ni wedi derbyn tystiolaeth bod pob un o'r cynghorau'n mynd i ddefnyddio'r fframwaith asiantaeth o fis Ebrill ymlaen. Bydd yna ddim *pool* o fewn unrhyw un o'r awdurdodau lleol o beth rydyn ni'n ei ddeall. Beth sy'n fy mhoeni i ydy: mae yna erbyn hyn fodel cenedlaethol o ran y consortia i fod, ac eto mae yna amrywiaeth enfawr ar draws Cymru ynglŷn â lle mae'r adrannau adnoddau

terms of developing their human resources services jointly. Some of the consortia work more closely together, perhaps, than others. The intention, as I understand it, is to move more of that human resources work to the consortia of local authorities, so that there is greater consistency in terms of human resources across the consortia.

**Ms Evans:** May I just come in at this point? When we carried out the field work for the report that was published in September 2013, what we saw then was that there were some authorities that were still implementing some sort of pool of supply teachers. So, they had a list of people and then the schools could choose. In one authority, for example, it was a paper list. The school would receive a copy of who was available to undertake supply work and then they could select from those people. In other authorities, then, they used companies to provide an online list of supply teachers, so going through something like *Eteach*, or something like that, and then schools could get in contact through that. Then, in other authorities we saw that there wasn't anything specific in place, and so schools would tend to make direct contact with some sort of agency that they'd formed a relationship with in terms of the work.

Also, when we carried out that research work, in some schools—not in every one, but in some of the schools that we visited—what they said was that, because of the changes taking place at a local authority level, the advice and the leadership that they received from the HR departments in the council was variable, and because fewer people were filling those roles, that has had an impact on how much leadership and advice they can access when it comes to managing staff and supply teachers.

**Aled Roberts:** What concerns me is that we have received evidence that every one of the councils is going to use the agency framework from April onwards. There won't be a pool within any local authorities, as we understand it. What concerns me is that there is now a national model in place in terms of the consortia, or there's supposed to be one in place at least, and yet there is huge variation across Wales in terms of where the human

dynol yn sefyll. Os ydym yn derbyn, cyn inni weld defnydd o'r athrawon cyflenwi yma, fod yna angen i arweinwyr ysgol ac adrannau addysg reoli absenoldeb athrawon yn y lle cyntaf, sy'n creu'r mater yma, ac os oes arweinwyr sydd ddim mor gadarn o fewn rhai ysgolion, lle'n union maen nhw'n mynd os oes yna gymhlethdod yna o ran pwy sy'n eu cynghori nhw ynglŷn â beth i'w wneud efo patrymau absenoldeb?

[19] **Ms Evans:** Pan wnaethom ni'r gwaith maes ar gyfer yr adroddiad, beth welsom ni, adeg hynny, oedd bod llawer o'r awdurdodau wedi arwyddo i gytundeb cenedlaethol. Ond, yr her a welsom ni oedd bod y bobl oedd wedi cofrestru i weithio fel athrawon cyflenwi yn tueddu i gwmpo i mewn i ddau *camp*: naill ai athrawon sydd newydd gymhwyso sydd ddim yn gallu cael contract parhaol, neu bobl sydd wedi penderfynu ymddeol ac yna'n gwneud ychydig o waith cyflenwi. Ac mae yna ychydig o bobl, oherwydd rhesymau teuluol neu resymau personol, sy'n mwynhau'r amrywiaeth y mae gweithio fel athro cyflenwi yn gallu ei gynnig. Ond un o'r pethau roeddem ni'n ei weld wrth sgwrsio ag athrawon cyflenwi oedd y ffaith nad oedden nhw'n cael eu talu ar brif raddfa athrawon. Er bod ysgol yn talu swm i asiantaeth gyflenwi, roedd swm penodol. Ni allaf roi ffigur pendant ichi ond yn sicr roedd swm sylweddol o'r arian hynny yn mynd tuag at yr asiantaeth ac nid at yr athro. Felly, roedd yna fwllch eithaf mawr rhwng cyflog athro sy'n cael ei gyflogi gan ysgol a beth mae athrawon cyflenwi yn cael eu talu trwy asiantaeth.

[20] **Aled Roberts:** Ond pam mae'r lefelau absenoldeb gymaint yn fwy yng Nghymru nag ydynt ar draws y ffin? Dyna'r dystiolaeth rydym ni wedi'i derbyn. O achos hynny, mae yna fwy o ddefnydd o athrawon cyflenwi yn cael ei wneud.

[21] **Mr Rowlands:** Rwy'n credu eich bod chi'n iawn i ddweud bod y tirlun yn gymhleth. Mae yna gyfrifoldeb gan yr ysgol unigol, mae yna gyfrifoldeb gan yr awdurdod, ac mae yna gyfrifoldeb gan y consortia. Fel rydych chi'n ei ddisgrifio, mae hynny'n symud ac yn esblygu ar hyn o bryd. Mae yna hefyd gyfrifoldeb gan y Llywodraeth. Rydym ni'n deall bod y Llywodraeth yn paratoi canllawiau ar gyfer ysgolion ar hyn o bryd ac mi fydd hynny yn gaffaeliad. Mae'n bwysig, rwy'n credu, fod yna

resources departments sit. If we accept, before we see the use of these supply teachers, that school leaders and education departments need to manage teacher absences in the first place, which is what's creating this problem, and if there are leaders in some schools who aren't as strong, where exactly do they go if there is any confusion in terms of who advises them on what to do about patterns of absence?

**Ms Evans:** When we did the field work for our report, what we saw at that time was that many of the authorities had signed up to the national agreement. But the challenge that we found was that the people who had registered to work as supply teachers tended to fall into two camps: either they were newly qualified teachers who couldn't get a permanent contract, or they were people who had decided to retire and then to do a little supply work. There are also some people, for family reasons or personal reasons, who do enjoy the variety that working as a supply teacher can provide. One of the things we found in speaking with supply teachers was the fact that they aren't paid on teachers' main pay scale. Although schools pay a certain amount to a supply agency, it was a specified sum. I can't give you a definitive figure here, but certainly a significant proportion of that money was going to the agency rather than to the teacher. So, there was quite a big disparity between the salary of a teacher employed by a school and what supply teachers are paid through an agency.

**Aled Roberts:** But why is it that absence levels are so much higher in Wales than they are over the border? That is the evidence that we have received. As a result of that, there is a far greater use of supply teachers being made here.

**Mr Rowlands:** I think you are right in saying that the landscape is complex. There is a responsibility on the part of the school, the local authority and the consortia. As you have described, that is evolving and shifting at present. There is also a responsibility on the part of the Government. We understand that the Government is currently preparing guidance for schools, and that will certainly be useful. It is important, I believe, that we should have something central in place in

rywbeth canolog yng Nghymru hefyd o ran canllawiau i ysgolion ond hefyd ganllawiau a hyfforddiant canolog i athrawon llanw fel eu bod nhw'n medru mynd ar wefan, a derbyn hyfforddiant yn y ffordd yna.

Wales, as well, in terms of guidance for schools, but also in terms of central guidance and training for supply teachers, so that they can go online and they can receive training in that manner.

[22] Mae'n wir i ddweud bod yr adroddiad a wnaethom ni yn awgrymu bod yna fwy o salwch ymhlith athrawon yng Nghymru nag sydd yn Lloegr. Mae'n eithaf anodd cymharu'r ffigurau. Nid yw'n hollol glir pam mae hynny. Mae'r amrywiaeth, a dweud y gwir, yn wahanol iawn o awdurdod i awdurdod. Yn sicr, mi fyddai lot o hynny yn gwella petai pob ysgol yn dilyn y prosesau adnoddau dynol gorau—hynny yw, pethau fel gwneud yn siŵr, ar ôl pob cyfnod o salwch, fod cyfweliad â'r bobl i ffeindio allan beth oedd yn bod, ac yn y blaen. Ond, fel yr oeddwn i'n ei awgrymu, un o'r prif resymau bod yna amrywiaeth rhwng un ysgol a'r llall o ran absenoldeb athrawon ydy safon yr arweinyddiaeth. Pan nad yw'r ysgol yn un hapus, mae yna lawer mwy o absenoldeb yn mynd i ddiwydd.

It is true to say that the report that we published did suggest that there were greater levels of teacher sickness absence in Wales than is the case in England. It's quite difficult to compare the figures. It isn't entirely clear why that is the case. The variations, in all honesty, vary greatly from one authority to another. Certainly, much of that would improve if every school were to follow best practice in terms of HR processes—for example, ensuring that, after every period of sickness, a return-to-work interview is conducted with those people to discuss what was wrong, and so on. But, as I suggested, one of the main reasons for the variations between one school and another in terms of teacher absence is the quality of the leadership. If the school is not a happy one, then there will be far greater absence.

[23] **Ann Jones:** I've got Keith. You've been waiting.

[24] **Keith Davies:** Llongyfarchiadau, Meilyr. Rwy'n falch o weld rhywun arall o Ddyffryn Aman yn cael ei gefnogi.

**Keith Davies:** Congratulations, Meilyr. I'm glad to see someone else from the Amman Valley going up in the world.

[25] **Mr Rowlands:** Diolch yn fawr.

**Mr Rowlands:** Thank you.

09:45

[26] **Keith Davies:** Dau gwestiwn bach sydd gyda fi mewn ffordd. A oes yna rannau o Gymru lle mae e'n broblem i gael athrawon cyflenwi? Os ŷch chi mewn dinas, efallai fod llawer mwy o obaith gyda chi, ond mewn ardal wledig, efallai ei bod hi'n anoddach.

**Keith Davies:** I've got two quick questions, in a way. Are there any parts of Wales where it is difficult to get supply teachers? If you're in a city, perhaps you've got much more of a chance, but in a rural area, it may be more difficult.

[27] Y cwestiwn arall, sy'n dod nôl i'r pethau dynol yr oeddech chi'n sôn amdanyn nhw nawr, yw bod athrawon yn cael eu cyflogi gan yr awdurdod, ond dylai hynny fod yn wir am yr athrawon cyflenwi hefyd, ond nid wyf i'n credu bod yr awdurdodau'n gweld hynny, sef bod y cyfrifoldeb gyda nhw am y bobl sy'n dod i mewn fel athrawon cyflenwi, ac wedyn mae'n beth eithaf gwan.

The other question, which comes back to the human issues that you were talking about, is that teachers are employed by the authority, but that should be true for supply teachers, too, but I don't believe that the authorities see that, namely that they have responsibility for the people who come in as supply teachers, and so, there's a weakness there.

[28] **Mr Rowlands:** Mae argaeledd athrawon llanw yn amrywio o ardal i ardal.

**Mr Rowlands:** The availability of supply teachers varies from one area to another. It

Mae'n medru bod yn fwy anodd mewn ardaloedd gwledig, er enghraifft. Mae'n medru amrywio hefyd o bwnc i bwnc. Mewn ysgolion uwchradd, er enghraifft, mae'n fwy anodd i gael y pynciau y mae'n fwy anodd i benodi iddyn nhw'n gyffredinol—pethau fel gwyddoniaeth a mathemateg. Mae'n medru amrywio o sector i sector i ryw raddau hefyd, ac mae e hefyd yn medru amrywio o ysgol i ysgol, fel yr oeddwn i'n ei ddweud. Mae athrawon llanw gyda dewis ble maen nhw'n mynd ac maen nhw'n mynd i ddewis peidio â mynd i rai ysgolion os ydyn nhw'n dymuno peidio â gwneud hynny oherwydd bod yna enw drwg gan yr ysgol, er enghraifft. Felly, mae hynny'n mynd i amrywio.

[29] Mae pwy sy'n gyfrifol am yr athrawon llanw yn gyfreithiol yn fater cymhleth. Os ydyn nhw'n gweithio i asiantaethau, mae eu telerau nhw'n medru bod yn wahanol, o beth rwy'n ei ddeall. Dyna pam, ar y cyfan, rwy'n credu ei fod e'n llawer haws os taw'r ysgol sy'n penodi'r bobl yma. Mae'r athrawon llanw'n manteisio wedyn o hyfforddiant. Maen nhw'n manteisio o reoli perfformiad, ac maen nhw'n cael yr holl bethau yna y mae athro sy'n gyflogedig gan yr ysgol yn eu cael. Wrth gwrs, mae nifer fawr o ysgolion yn gwneud hyn, yn enwedig ysgolion uwchradd ac ysgolion cynradd mawr. Mae'n fwy anodd, wrth gwrs, i ysgolion cynradd llai—ysgolion bach—ond mae yna enghreifftiau o ysgolion bach yn cynghreirio â'i gilydd i gyflogi pobl ar y cyd. Yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddodd ni tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, mae yna achos o hynny yn Rhyl, lle mae yna nifer o ysgolion cynradd wedi dod at ei gilydd gan gydweithio â'r ysgol uwchradd i rannu athrawon llanw.

[30] **Keith Davies:** A ydyn nhw'n talu pensiynau yn Rhyl wedyn? Achos dyna'r cwestiwn mawr arall. Os ydyn nhw i mewn gyda'r awdurdod, maen nhw wedyn yn gallu cael eu pensiwn wedi ei dalu. Os ydyn nhw i mewn gydag ysgolion, a yw'r ysgolion yn mynd i dalu eu pensiynau nhw?

[31] **Mr Rowlands:** Ydyn. Os yw athro yn cael ei gyflogi gan ysgol, mae'r holl delerau yr un peth.

[32] **Ann Jones:** David, on the use of supply teachers.

[33] **David Rees:** Thank you. Just a couple of quick points, obviously, because I want to

can be more difficult in rural areas, for example. It can also vary from subject to subject. In secondary schools, for example, it's more difficult to get supply teachers for those subjects for which it's more difficult to recruit teachers more generally—subjects such as science and mathematics. It can vary from sector to sector to a certain extent too and it can also vary from school to school, as I said earlier. Supply teachers can pick and choose the schools that they go to, and they may choose not to work in certain schools, if they decide not to because the school has something of a bad reputation, for example. So, that is going to vary.

Who is legally responsible for supply teachers is a complex issue. If they work for agencies, then their terms and conditions can be different, from what I understand. That is why, generally speaking, I feel that it is far easier if the school appoints these people. The supply teachers can then benefit from training. They benefit from performance management systems and they get all of those things that a teacher employed by the school would get as a matter of course. Of course, many schools do this, particularly secondary schools and the larger primary schools. It's more difficult, of course, for smaller primary schools—small schools—but there are examples of small schools forming alliances or clustering to employ people jointly. In the report that we published some two years ago, there is an example of that in Rhyl, where many primary schools came together and collaborated with the secondary school in order to share supply teachers.

**Keith Davies:** Do they pay their pensions in Rhyl then? Because that's the other big question. If they are in with the authority, they can then get their pension paid to them. If they are in with the schools, are the schools going to pay their pensions?

**Mr Rowlands:** Yes. If a teacher is employed by a school, then the terms and conditions are the same.



come back to performance management later. One of the things that concerned me was the lack of data you identified, or that's been identified in the evidence we've received, on this issue of absences and the data collection on performance as well. What can we do to ensure that? Without that information and without that basis, clearly there are some judgments that can't be made either by the schools or by the authorities in relation to actually how they actually tackle the absences of staff in the first instance, to ensure that that does not happen, but also to ensure that the performance of the staff coming in to cover—and I don't want to use the word 'cover'; I want to use 'teach' because there is terminology of 'cover'—. But I'll come back to that in a minute about the use of teachers. How do we get the data instilled into the system to ensure that we can actually see what's going on?

[34] **Mr Rowlands:** Yes, that's a very good point, and I think it is essential that we do have very good data on this. As I was saying earlier, it's essential that schools employ the best HR processes. One of the tools is to have data so that you can benchmark yourself against other, similar schools. So, if you've got no idea what the attendance rate of teachers is in general, you don't know whether you've got a problem in your school or not. So, there is a responsibility, I would suggest, on local authorities to make sure that they give schools a suite of data so that the school is able to benchmark things like attendance rates.

[35] **David Rees:** Will that be coming back to—[*Inaudible.*]

[36] **Mr Rowlands:** Well, possibly, yes.

[37] **Ms Evans:** When we carried out the survey, one of the things that schools told us was that they forwarded information about teacher absence back to HR departments but that not all of the local authorities then provided some analysis for them to use so that they were able to compare how their absences were similar to other schools maybe with the same sort of profile or of the same size within the local authority. Just from recent inspection activity, I can see that some schools do have some comparative data from the local authorities, but it's not an overly complex analysis and, whilst it does provide, at a high level, some useful information, I think there's a need for more detailed information. One of the other things we saw as part of the survey was how schools themselves are monitoring the use of supply teachers or cover supervisors or higher level teaching assistants to manage absence. So, in some of the best examples, they were tracking to see how often a particular class, 8A, for example, had a supply teacher during a term or, in a particular day, whether the same class is having more than one supply teacher. But I think it's fair to say that they were very much in the minority and that that good practice was not seen across the majority of the schools we visited.

[38] **David Rees:** Can I come back then, because I also have a question on cover, because you've mentioned it. I understand the argument that you put forward for someone being permanently employed by the school. I understand those arguments, but then there's a question because you also highlight the lack of subject skills in some areas. Does that actually deteriorate the concept of being able to cover and of supply teaching because, if you have a cover, they tend to be a generalist in one sense, and sometimes you want skills in a certain subject area to be able to be sure that pupils get the subject being delivered? So, how do we stand in the situation where we have a general situation of a generalist, effectively, but you need specialist subject skills to ensure that pupils actually attain the outcomes we want? Where is the balance going to be drawn on that?

[39] **Mr Rowlands:** There isn't a solution to that, really. Clearly, in a long-term absence, which is easier to plan for—and when you're talking about subject expertise, you're really talking about secondary schools, to some extent—you need subject specialists. When you have shorter term absences, there is a balance to be drawn between bringing in a subject specialist, who might not understand the school processes, who might not know—. If you bring in a scientist to a new school, it will take him or her quite a long time to actually know where all the

equipment is kept. So, actually, having someone who might not be 100% specialist in the short term might be more effective. So, it's really up to the school—

[40] **David Rees:** Can I ask, effective at what: simply looking after the children and behavioural management or effective at delivery of the curriculum?

[41] **Mr Rowlands:** At actually delivering a lesson because, you know, in some of the secondary schools, they will have more than one floating cover staff, who can actually specialise to some extent—you know, someone who does the humanities, someone who does the sciences and maths. There will be a certain amount of specialisation going on, but I accept totally that there will have to be a balance drawn, and there's a point at which the management of the school will have to decide what is the most effective way forward.

[42] **David Rees:** And in your research, what percentage of the use of supply teachers was basically short term and what percentage was longer term?

[43] **Mr Rowlands:** Well, the definition of that is quite difficult as well. I mean, roughly speaking, we found that you wouldn't get outside supply in on a long-term basis until between 10 and 20 days.

[44] **Ms Evans:** Schools' own definitions of what they classed as long-term absence vary. So, in some schools, they said three days or more, because, often, that tied in with their insurance policy, and that triggered payments to procure a supply teacher, so then they classed that as more of a long-term absence, yet we visited some other schools and they said it was 10 days; some other schools said it was 20 days. So, it did vary from school to school.

[45] I think when we visited some schools where they had in-house cover supervisors or supply teachers—so there were qualified teachers—one of the things, from talking to them, that we saw was that they were able to speak with the head of department. They knew them, because they'd developed a relationship because they were permanently in the school. They were aware of things like the behaviour management processes, the name of the head of year or the name of staff in the school. So, that kind of continuity was helpful in terms of developing relationships with the pupils, and they could then say to the head of the department, 'Oh, you've provided this' or 'The teacher's left this for me to do. Can I just have a quick chat with you about this?' So, yes, it doesn't mitigate the absence of the permanent teacher, but it seemed to be a stronger way of managing it than having somebody come in who arrived at the school 10 minutes or 15 minutes before the start of the day and really had to find their way to the classroom without knowing very much else about the school.

[46] **Ann Jones:** Paul wants to come in on data, I think, and then Aled, and I'll come back to you.

[47] **Paul Davies:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Ar y mater o gasglu data, wrth gwrs, mae'n bwysig bod yna ddata clir ar absenoldeb athrawon. Nawr, dywedoch chi yn gynharach, wrth gwrs, fod yna gyfrifoldeb gan awdurdodau lleol i gasglu'r data yma, ond a ydych chi'n dweud yn y dyfodol y dylai'r cyfrifoldeb fod gyda'r consortia rhanbarthol i gasglu'r data yma?

**Paul Davies:** Thank you, Chair. On the issue of collecting data, of course, it is important that there are clear data on teacher absence. Now, you said earlier, of course, that local authorities had the responsibility for collecting these data, but are you saying, in the future, the responsibility should lie with the regional consortia to collect those data?

[48] **Mr Rowlands:** Nid oes barn gennyf i ar hynny yn bersonol—p'un ai taw'r awdurdodau neu'r consortia, nid wyf i'n gwybod. Mae'n bosib bod yna symudiad at

**Mr Rowlands:** I have no particular view on that, personally—whether it's the authorities or the consortia, I'm not sure. There may be a shift towards consortia; I'm not sure. But

gonsortia, nid wyf i'n gwybod. Ond beth sy'n bwysig ydy, fel oedd Catherine yn dweud, mae'r ysgol yn bwydo data i'r awdurdod neu'r consortiwm a nhw, felly—un ai'r awdurdod neu'r consortiwm—sydd â'r gallu wedi hynny i roi'r data yna at ei gilydd a'u gyrru nhw yn ôl i'r ysgol fel y data meincnodi.

what's important is that, as Catherine said, the school provides data to the authority or the consortium, and they, therefore—either the authority or the consortium—have the ability then to collate those data and to feed them back to the school as benchmarking data.

[49] **Paul Davies:** Yn eich tyb chi, pwy fyddai orau i arwain ar hwn, y consortia neu'r awdurdodau lleol?

**Paul Davies:** In your view, who would be best placed to lead on this, the consortia or the local authorities?

[50] **Mr Rowlands:** Nid oes barn gref gennyf i ar hynny. Beth sy'n bwysig ydy bod rhywun yn ei wneud e.

**Mr Rowlands:** I have no strong opinions on that. What's important is that somebody does it.

[51] **Ann Jones:** Aled, finally, on this. We're still on the first set of questions, I might add, and we've had half an hour, so we need to—

[52] **Aled Roberts:** Ond dyna'r pwynt—mae'n ymddangos o'ch adroddiad chi, a gyhoeddwyd rhyw 18 mis yn ôl, nad yw hynny yn digwydd. Nid oes dadansoddiad yn yr ysgol. Nid oes cymharu o fewn yr awdurdod lleol na'r consortiwm. Felly, sut maen nhw'n dadansoddi? Mae yna ryw batrwm yma'n cael ei greu lle mae yna lond lori o ddata yn cael eu casglu ac yn cael eu symud o'r ysgolion, ond nid oes neb yn dadansoddi beth ydy'r broblem.

**Aled Roberts:** But that's the point—it appears from your report, which was published some 18 months ago, that that doesn't happen. There's no analysis in the school. No comparison is made within the local authority or the consortium. So how do they analyse it? There's a pattern being created where a truckload of data are collected and taken from the schools, but no-one is analysing what the problem is.

[53] Rwyf eisiau gofyn ichi hefyd, yn eu hymateb i'ch adroddiad chi, fe ddywedodd Llywodraeth Cymru eu bod nhw'n mynd i fynd yn ôl at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i weld yn union beth oedd yn digwydd ac i weld os oedd gan y cynghorau yma, erbyn hyn, y modd i ddadansoddi a gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r peth. A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o beth sydd wedi dod yn ôl wrth y cynghorau a beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud, achos rwy'n meddwl bod hyn yn creu sefyllfa o gryn bryder imi, a dweud y gwir? Rydym ni'n sôn am 10 y cant o wersi Cymru. Sut ydym ni'n mynd i wella cyrhaeddiad os, o fewn y 10 y cant o wersi yna, mae'r plant eu hunain yn dweud wrthym mai beth maen nhw'n ei wneud, rhan amlaf, ydy *wordsearch*?

I also want to ask you, in their response to your report, the Welsh Government said that they would go back to the Welsh Local Government Association to see exactly what was happening and to see whether these councils now had the means to analyse and to do something about this. Are you aware of what has come back from the councils and what the Government is doing, because I think that this creates a situation that causes me some concern, frankly? We're talking about 10 per cent of Welsh lessons. How are we going to improve attainment if, within those 10 per cent of lessons, the children themselves are telling us that what they're usually doing is wordsearches?

10:00

[54] **Mr Rowlands:** Nid oes gennyf wybodaeth ynglŷn â hynny, p'un ai bod—

**Mr Rowlands:** I have no particular information on that, whether—

[55] **Aled Roberts:** Felly, nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi dod yn ôl atoch chi a dweud,

**Aled Roberts:** So, the Government hasn't got back to you and said, 'Well, this is what

‘Wel, dyma ydy beth rydym ni wedi ei ddarganfod, a dyma beth rydym ni wedi ei gytuno sy’n mynd i ddiwydd o hyn ymlaen’, achos ar hyn o bryd mae fel petai’r cynghorau lleol yn dweud, ‘O, mater i’r ysgolion a’r consortia ydy o’, ac mae’r consortia yn dweud, ‘Mater i’r ysgolion a’r awdurdodau lleol ydy o’. Ac, yn y cyfamser, mae’r holl blant yma yn cael eu hamddifadu i ryw raddau, achos dim ond un cyfle y mae’r plant yma yn ei gael o ran cyrhaeddiad, onid e?’

we’ve discovered and this is what we have agreed will happen from here on in’, because at the moment it appears that the local authorities are saying, ‘Well, it’s matter for the schools and the consortia’, the consortia ‘Well, it’s a matter for the school and the local authority’. And, in the meantime, all of these children are being deprived in educational terms to some extent, because these children will have only one opportunity in terms of attainment.

[56] **Mr Rowlands:** O ran y mater yna, nid oes gennyf i wybodaeth i’w roi i chi ar y mater penodol yna. Fy nealltwriaeth i ydy bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn darparu canllawiau a chynghor i ysgolion, ac y bydd rheini’n cael eu cyhoeddi gyda’r bwriad o’u gweithredu o fis Medi ymlaen. Ac wedyn ar ôl cyfnod o amser o hynny yn cael ei weithredu mewn ysgolion, mae’n debyg y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gofyn i Estyn wneud arolwg arall i gymharu â’r un wnaethom ni 18 mis yn ôl i weld a oes yna welliant wedi bod.

**Mr Rowlands:** On that issue, I have no information to give you specifically on that matter. My understanding is that the Welsh Government provides guidance and advice to schools, and that that will be published with the intention of implementing it from September onwards. And then after a period of time of that being implemented in schools, it is likely that the Government will ask Estyn to undertake another review in order to compare with the one that we carried 18 months ago and to see whether there has been an improvement.

[57] **Ann Jones:** Right, we’re going to make some progress. We’re going to come on to outcomes for pupils, because I think that’s as important as the use of supply teachers.

[58] **Lynne Neagle:** Thanks, Chair. Can I just ask, in terms of pupil outcomes, are there any particular subjects or cohorts of pupils where you think they’re being more adversely affected by the use of supply teachers?

[59] **Mr Rowlands:** The use of supply teachers I think is particularly sensitive with special needs children, for example. When we talk to special needs schools, they either have their own cover staff internally, or they use a very small select group of external supply staff—because clearly, with children with special needs, often routines and things are very important to them—so that they’re familiar with the staff. So, that’s very important.

[60] Clearly, what our report said was that the effect of teacher absence was more clearly seen in secondary schools and in key stage 3 in particular. So, many of the primary schools will deal with teacher absence by using higher level teaching assistants or other teaching assistants stepping up in the short term, working together with other teachers. And, in that sort of way, they manage to cover lessons.

[61] In secondary schools, where the subject specialism is a bigger issue, schools often rearrange lessons so that it doesn’t affect key stage 4 and sixth form, and that then disproportionately affects key stage 3. So, that’s probably the area that gets the worst impact of this.

[62] **Ms Evans:** When we carried out the survey, what we saw was that what they may do is move a member of staff around, so that, if there’s a year 11 class, for example, they might move a permanent member of staff to teach that for a period of time, and then the supply teacher would move to a different class. We saw that there was an impact on some practical subjects, such as design and technology, physical education, and music, where, if they weren’t able to

secure a subject specialist, then they weren't able to take them out to do hockey or they weren't able to do whatever they were going to do in music, or maybe a cookery lesson. So, pupils told us that it impacted on them. Modern foreign languages and Welsh second language were also other examples, where, again, if they weren't able to secure a cover supervisor or a supply teacher who had those particular skills, then that's where they tended to do some low-level activities.

[63] When we spoke to pupils, in the report we mention that sometimes they worked on paper and that that work then wasn't marked—it seemed to just almost disappear into the ether—and that they sometimes undertook low-level tasks, or not low level tasks, but things like watching a film or a wordsearch, and it didn't always connect with their prior learning. I'm giving some of the worst examples. There were some good examples as well, where there was suitable planning. In, for example, primary schools, where a HLTA who works in the school covers for a teacher, then they were aware of the pupils' needs within the class. They'd know, if there are pupils who are on the school's additional learning needs register, what their specific needs are, so that they're able to provide a little bit more continuity in those sorts of things.

[64] **Lynne Neagle:** So, other than moving classes around and reorganising things, are there other examples of good strategies being put in place to militate against the use of supply teachers?

[65] **Ms Evans:** I think it comes back to the school's arrangements for teacher absence. As Meilyr mentioned at the start of the session, it's about the leadership of the school, the vision of the headteacher and the robust structures in place to not only monitor teacher absence, but when teachers are absent, there is a clear programme; there's a handbook, if you have a supply teacher, which provides basic information about the school and what to do in specific circumstances. They may use a smaller pool of supply teachers where they can offer some basic training to them. So, those are the sorts of things that schools can do to help mitigate the absence of the permanent member of staff.

[66] **Mr Rowlands:** And also the planning and the monitoring of the actual absences itself. So, if you have a large complex school, it's important to keep track of who is going out on various courses, so that not too many are going out at the same time and that sort of thing. So, in a well-run school, that's exactly what the management do: they make sure there's not too much of that going on. And there are other activities that middle managers do, like lesson observation, preparing schemes of work and that sort of thing, that can be done maybe when there isn't a lot of absence for whatever reason. So, it's all to do with choreographing the planned absences so that you reduce the need, as far as is possible.

[67] **Lynne Neagle:** And in terms of the kind of the measures you refer to, to support supply teachers, you've said that happens in some schools. So, what you're saying is that that's by no means uniform. So, do you think that that's something that the Welsh Government should be tackling and making that a more uniform policy?

[68] **Ms Evans:** When we spoke to supply teachers, they said that their experiences from schools did vary. So, in the best examples, they were met by somebody at the start of the day, they were given a handbook, they were asked to provide some brief comments about the lessons and what happened at the end of the day, and there was somebody within the school who acted like an informal link or line manager really, so that, at the end of the day, there was a debrief so that they could get some feedback and they could give some feedback to the school. One of the things that Meilyr mentioned was about the development of resources, and from our discussions with colleagues in Welsh Government, they noted that they were in the process of developing some—I don't know the exact title—more guidance materials so that they could take some of the best examples and provide those online, so that schools could adopt them and supply teachers could also use them as well.

[69] **Lynne Neagle:** Thank you, Chair.

[70] **Ann Jones:** Bethan, you had one on HLTAs.

[71] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwyf jest eisiau gofyn yn glou, yn amlwg mae HLTAs yn llenwi amser cynllunio, paratoi ac asesu yn eithaf aml, felly maen nhw efallai yn deall mwy am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y dosbarth. A ydych chi'n cael unrhyw fath o ddata sy'n dangos bod ysgolion—nid wyf eisiau dweud hyn mewn ffordd rhy negyddol—efallai yn cymryd mantais o'r HLTAs o ran amodau gwaith a'u termau gwaith nhw, yn lle mynd allan i gael athro cyflenwi, oherwydd y byddai'n rhatach efallai iddyn nhw ailstrwythuro o fewn yr ysgol yn hytrach na chael rhywun o'r tu fas i wneud hynny?

**Bethan Jenkins:** I just want to ask quickly, obviously HLTAs cover planning, preparation and assessment time quite often, so they perhaps have a better understanding of what is happening in the classroom. Do you receive any sort of data that shows that schools may—I don't want to put it too negatively—perhaps take advantage of the HLTAs in terms of their working conditions and the terms of their work, rather than going out to get a supply teacher because it might perhaps be cheaper for them to restructure within the school rather than getting someone external to do that?

[72] **Mr Rowlands:** Mae dyfodiad llawer mwy o gynorthwywyr cyflenwi, neu gynorthwywyr llanw, oherwydd y gwaith cynllunio, paratoi ac asesu wedi newid hinsawdd o fewn ysgolion. Dyna pam rwy'n credu fy mod wedi pwysleisio ei bod yn syniad da i'r ysgol gyflogi staff sy'n medru llanw, oherwydd bod ysgolion yn gwneud hynny beth bynnag oherwydd yr amser cynllunio, paratoi ac asesu. Mae ganddyn nhw staff yn gwneud hynny.

**Mr Rowlands:** The advent of more supply assistants or cover assistants because of the planning, preparation and assessment work has changed the climate within schools. That's why I think I have emphasised that it's a good idea for the school to employ staff who can cover, because schools do that in any case because of the planning, preparation and assessment time. They have staff already doing that.

[73] Nid wyf yn credu bod gennym ni lawer o dystiolaeth bod HLTAs yn cael eu camdefnyddio yn y ffordd hyn. Maen nhw yn cael eu defnyddio, ac yn aml iawn maen nhw'n gwerthfawrogi'r cyfle i wneud. Unwaith eto, mae'n dibynnu ar ba mor effeithiol yw'r arweinyddiaeth mewn ysgol. Hynny yw, os ych chi jest yn taflu rhywun i mewn i arwain y dosbarth heb gefnogaeth, mae hynny'n wahanol i gydweithio gydag athro o ddosbarth arall, er enghraifft.

I don't think that we have a great deal of evidence that HLTAs are being misused in this way. They are being used and very often they appreciate the opportunity to carry out these responsibilities. Once again, it depends on how effective the leadership is within a school. That's to say, if you simply throw someone before a class without providing support, that's very different to collaborating with a teacher from another class, for example.

[74] **Ms Evans:** Pan wnaethom ni ymweld â rhai o'r ysgolion cynradd, beth oedden ni'n weld oedd mai HLTAs a oedd yn gweithredu ar lefel 4, sef y lefel uchaf, a oedd yn tueddu i wneud y rôl yma, nid HLTAs oedd ar lefel isaf y raddfa, fel petai. Felly, fel roedd Meilyr yn dweud, mae'n dod yn ôl i sut mae hynny'n cael ei reoli a pa fath o hyfforddiant hefyd maen nhw'n ei gael i allu cyflawni'r rôl.

**Ms Evans:** When we visited some of the primary schools, what we saw was that HLTAs operating on level 4, which is the highest level, tended to carry out this role, not the HLTAs on the lowest end of the scale, as it were. So, as Meilyr said, it comes back to how that is managed and also what kind of training they receive to be able to fulfil that role.

[75] **Ann Jones:** Suzy, shall we come to your questions?

[76] **Suzy Davies:** I've got a couple of specific questions on specialist subjects, but I want to begin with a question about the in-school cover, specifically with secondary schools. Is there any information available at the moment about the change between key stage 3 and key stage 4, and whether teachers at key stage 4 are reporting that they've seen a fall back in the achievements of pupils up to key stage 4, because they've had that disproportionate amount of supply teaching in the earlier years, or have they managed to catch up by key stage 4? The data may not be available, but I'm curious to know. We're obviously making something of this impact, but is there an impact, or is it actually all resolved and there's a happy ending?

[77] **Mr Rowlands:** It's a good question, because you always have this difficulty of allocating a specific cause to a particular effect. Certainly, when we saw individual lessons, you could say that the progress made by those children wasn't as quick as it should be. But when you aggregate all of that to a key stage, I don't think that key stage 4 teachers, who are often actually the same teachers as key stage 3 teachers, are saying 'The reason we're not getting good results at key stage 4 is because there's too much supply teaching in key stage 3'. That would be maybe a step too far. But it is in the mix as an effect, and as we said, that will vary quite substantially between school and school.

[78] **Suzy Davies:** That's what I wanted to ask you: is it easier to deal with in-school cover in a large school rather than a smaller school? I know there may be questions about schools in deprived areas, but even rural secondary schools can be comparatively small.

[79] **Ms Evans:** When we carried out the survey, one of the things we saw was that in very small primary schools where you had a teaching head, if that teacher was absent for a long period of time, not only did you lose the teacher but you also lost the leader of the school. So, that had almost a double effect on the pupils there, because the responsibility then for leading the school and arranging the cover and liaising with whoever was covering was left to the person who was in the school.

[80] As Meilyr said, it's difficult to link cause and effect fully, but from our inspection evidence sometimes we see particular examples where there is long-term absence, so, if a member of staff is absent for a long time. But it's not like in maternity leave where somebody says 'I'm not going to be here for six, nine or 12 months' and the school can respond; it's where somebody's absent for two weeks, then it's another two weeks and then it's another two weeks. So, providing continuity is more challenging for the school leaders, because they don't know exactly how long the person is going to be off, and so they tend to have a rollover of shorter-term arrangements that can have an impact then on pupils.

[81] **Mr Rowlands:** As Catherine says, that can particularly be the case in small primary schools when members of the senior management are off on stress, for example; that sort of situation can be a very difficult one, because they might be off for a fortnight and then come back, and then go off for another fortnight. And that sort of thing can become a real vicious circle and often these senior managers have a class that needs to be covered but then, if they are covered by a teacher, the management responsibilities aren't covered. Primary schools with long-term absence are a particular issue.

10:15

[82] **Suzy Davies:** Okay, thank you. I've just got these specific questions now on Welsh-medium provision and teaching of Welsh as a second language. I mean, obviously, there's a difficulty—you've identified it already—in finding supply teachers in these areas, so, presumably, there's a deficiency in the teaching cohort completely. Do you know what sort of conversations are happening with teacher training courses to help manage future workforce planning, if you like?

[83] **Mr Rowlands:** The shortages in supply staff are the same as the shortages in teaching staff generally, and this goes back a long, long time. So, the kind of strategies that are being used to attract people into sciences and modern foreign languages and Welsh are to advertise the advantages of these as careers, but also to offer bursaries. There are quite significant bursaries now—I think up to about £20,000—to study something like physics, if you've got a first-class degree—

[84] **Suzy Davies:** Particularly *trwy'r Gymraeg*, yes?

[85] **Mr Rowlands:** And there are bursaries also to support Welsh medium as well, yes. So, there are bursaries to support people going into initial teacher training who are Welsh medium and also there are courses for them to improve their Welsh.

[86] **Suzy Davies:** I mean, it may not be a question for you, but are these courses and incentives being taken up? Are we to take some sort of encouragement from how things are going on that front? Otherwise, we'll be having this inquiry again in 10 years.

[87] **Mr Rowlands:** One would assume that the situation would be even worse if they didn't exist. Clearly, there are still major shortages.

[88] **Suzy Davies:** Okay. One final question from me. In English-medium schools where Welsh is taught as a second language—and there are difficulties getting supply teachers there—is there any evidence that the school itself would employ somebody internally who just happens to be a Welsh speaker or has some Welsh language skills but absolutely no skills in teaching a language? Or is that perhaps a bit specific as a question?

[89] **Mr Rowlands:** Maybe Catherine's got some evidence. I haven't got specific evidence, but, clearly, with Welsh second language in English-medium schools, it's quite difficult to get teachers in the first place, and it's particularly difficult to get supply staff. So, schools will do whatever they can do, I guess, in those circumstances.

[90] **Ms Evans:** When we carried out the fieldwork, we didn't see any evidence of that. From talking to some supply teachers, one of the things they said was that, if they are able to work through the medium of Welsh, sometimes there are able to negotiate an extra £10 or £15 a day in terms of payment. That was the only evidence—

[91] **Suzy Davies:** Oh right. Wow. [*Laughter.*] Thank you, that's helpful.

[92] **Ann Jones:** We're going to have to make some progress. Training and performance management and then supply agencies are the two—. We've got about 12 minutes, but we can run five minutes over, I think.

[93] **David Rees:** Thanks, Chair. I'll try to be as quick as I can.

[94] **Ann Jones:** Thank you.

[95] **David Rees:** Obviously, training and performance management are very closely related. I'll take the performance management first, because I think the training follows on from that. What's the situation regarding performance? Whose responsibility is performance management assessment of supply teachers? If you're not a member of the school, which is one of the aspects you talked about, you are technically not in their school development plan. So, is it maybe the responsibility of the consortia? Should it be the responsibility of local authorities? Should local authorities have it in their development plans for schools to look at performance management of supply teachers? We're hearing sometimes that someone is a poor teacher, there



is not necessarily feedback directly to the authority or, sometimes, even to the teacher because you can't guarantee it's to the teacher. How, then, do they look at their development and training needs? So, it's a question of whose responsibility it is to actually ensure that it takes place, that the teachers are involved and informed of it and that they are going to assess where they go as a consequence of that.

[96] **Mr Rowlands:** I think it's true to say that it isn't done systematically, unless the supply staff are employed by the school. I think that's true. I think if a supply member of staff is particularly poor, there will usually be some sort of feedback given to them individually and then to the local authority or to the agency. That probably happens when the school thinks there's a particular issue and they don't want to use that person again. That usually is communicated. But that is—

[97] **David Rees:** But is that communicated to the teacher or to the agency?

[98] **Mr Rowlands:** I think both in that kind of situation, but that's a minority. I think you're quite right to be concerned that the bulk of staff who need some sort of feedback to improve don't get it. I think the blame is on both sides of it—the agency or the local authority don't ask for that feedback and the schools tend not to give it.

[99] **David Rees:** In some professions, obviously, CPD is a requirement. Should we be looking at ensuring that, in a sense, there should be a requirement for CPD of all professions in the teaching area?

[100] **Mr Rowlands:** Yes. Professional development is essential and performance management is essential. I don't think there's an easy answer to this, whether it's the local authority pool or whether it's agencies because the bottom line is money. All of those things would cost and I don't think anybody really wants to pay that. The schools don't really want to pay it; the local authority or the agency don't want to pay for professional development for the supply staff and the supply staff themselves don't want to give up a day. So, for example, a school might say, 'We're running some professional development and as supply staff, you can come on it.' If they're long-term, that's not a problem, but short-term staff will probably not join that professional development opportunity because they would be sacrificing a day where they could be earning money elsewhere.

[101] **David Rees:** The Minister has indicated that a professional learning model is coming along. How is that going to benefit supply teachers because you talked about the money and I understand that? We have seen Donaldson: a huge, dramatically changing curriculum. There are going to be major changes in the way in which teaching is going to be delivered in years to come. How do we ensure that that professional learning model actually applies to all of the profession and not just to those professionals employed permanently within a school environment?

[102] **Mr Rowlands:** Catherine's mentioned the fact that you could put a lot of the training material nowadays electronically. So, having a one-stop-shop for supply staff to get their training electronically would be one thing. My understanding of the new model is that there will be some sort of profile, or something maybe kept by the General Teaching Council for Wales, of all the professional development that all teachers have done, and that would be particularly useful for supply staff because they're in all different kinds of schools and organisations. Keeping track of what they've actually done would be an important step forward.

[103] **Ms Evans:** I think it comes back to the need for clarity in terms of whose responsibility it is to develop supply teachers or cover supervisors—whatever term we use. Once that role is explicit and clear, then the systems can develop within that.

[104] **David Rees:** Just a final point: the online approach and distance learning is a great approach, but they need some time for social interaction, for reflection and for groups to come together and we need to ensure that they have that opportunity as well so that they can actually share experience and learn from others.

[105] **Mr Rowlands:** Yes.

[106] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Supply agencies, Bethan.

[107] **Bethan Jenkins:** Roeddwn i jest yn moyn gofyn, rydych chi wedi siarad tamaid bach ynglŷn ag asiantaethau, ac mae'n rhywbeth y mae'r pwyllgor yma wedi bod yn dangos consŷrn amdano, a hefyd yn sgil y ffaith ein bod ni wedi clywed gan nifer o athrawon asiantaethau trwy'r ymgynghoriad sydd nid yn unig yn poeni am eu hamodau gwaith nhw, sy'n wahanol, fel yr ydych chi wedi dweud, ond oherwydd y ffaith nad ydyn nhw'n cael unrhyw fath o *feedback* ar ansawdd eu gwaith—dim ond os yw'n negyddol o ran sut mae'r dosbarth wedi ymddwyn, er enghraifft. Felly, jest cwestiwn ynglŷn â sut ydych chi'n credu y dylai'r Llywodraeth reoleiddio asiantaethau sydd gen i. Rydych yn dweud yn eich tystiolaeth fod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn cynghori ysgolion i beidio â'u defnyddio nhw. Beth yw'r meddylfryd o gwmpas hynny? Ac mae rhai ysgolion wedyn yn dweud nad ydyn nhw eisiau defnyddio asiantaethau. Eto, a ydy hynny jest yn ganran fach o ysgolion, neu a ydy hynny yn yr un awdurdod sydd yn dweud nad ydyn nhw eisiau defnyddio asiantaethau? Rwyf jest am ddeall a oes yna gysondeb neu ddim byd o gwbl ar draws Cymru.

[108] **Mr Rowlands:** Nid wyf yn credu bod yna lawer o gysondeb, ac mae e hefyd yn bictiwr sydd yn newid ac yn datblygu. Ond, jest i ailbwsleisio, yn sicr, rŷm ni'n credu bod rheoli perfformiad a hyfforddiant yn hollol hanfodol i staff cyflenwi, ac mae angen ffeindio ffordd i sicrhau hynny, oherwydd, hyd yn oed os oes gyda chi arbenigwyr pwnc, er enghraifft, oni bai eu bod nhw wedi cael hyfforddiant rheolaidd, cyson, ni fyddant yn gwybod am y fframwaith llythrennedd a rhifedd. Felly, mae'r disgwyliadau ar addysg ac ar athrawon mor uchel nawr, fedrwn ni ddim ffordd peidio â rhoi hyfforddiant cyson i athrawon llanw. Felly, mae'n rhaid ffeindio rhyw fath o ffordd ac mae yna nifer o ffyrdd o wneud hynny, wrth gwrs: rhyw fath o *kitemark* i'r asiantaethau yma, y math hynny o beth, neu fod yna ryw reolau ynglŷn â faint o

**Bethan Jenkins:** I just wanted to ask, you have talked a little bit about agencies, and it's something that this committee has been concerned about, and also as a result of the fact that we've heard from many agency teachers through the consultation who are concerned not just about their terms and conditions, which are different, as you have noted, but also there's the fact that they don't get any kind of feedback on the quality of their work—only if it's negative in terms of how the class has behaved, for example. So, my question is about how you believe the Government should regulate agencies. You state in your evidence that some local authorities advise schools not to use them. What is the thinking around that? And then other schools say that they don't want to use agencies. Again, is that just a small proportion of schools, or is that within the same authority that's saying that they don't want to use agencies? It's just to understand if there's consistency or if there's no consistency across Wales.

**Mr Rowlands:** I don't think there's a great deal of consistency, and it's also a picture that is changing and developing. But, just to re-emphasise this point, we certainly believe that performance management and training are crucially important for supply staff, and we need to find a way of ensuring that that is in place, because even if you do have a subject specialist, for example, unless that individual has received regular, consistent training, they won't know about the literacy and numeracy framework. So, the expectations placed on education and on teachers are so high now that we can't afford not to provide regular training to supply teachers. So, we have to find some way of achieving this and there are a number of ways in which that could be done, of course: some sort of *kitemark* for these agencies,

hyfforddiant y mae pob athro yn gorfod ei wneud mewn cyfnod o amser. Mae amryw ffyrdd o ddelio ag e.

[109] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ie, achos gwnes i gynnig, pan wnaethom ni gael sesiwn preifat gyda'r Wales Audit Office, efallai gallai fod rhyw fath o system bwyntiau lle byddai'r person unigol wedyn yn buddio, achos beth wnaethoch chi ei ddweud yn gynharach oedd nad yw person sy'n gweithio i asiantaeth eisiau cymryd unrhyw amser *off* cael arian i allu fforddio byw, ac felly rwy'n credu efallai fod angen darn o waith i edrych ar yr opsiynau ar gyfer sut i'w helpu nhw trwy'r broses yma. Jest o ran a fedrwch chi jest rhoi bach mwy o wybodaeth i ni ynglŷn â—. Nid wyf yn credu y gwnes i glywed sylw ynglŷn â beth ddywedais i ar y dechrau o ran rhai ysgolion yn cael rhyw fath o agwedd o beidio â defnyddio asiantaethau, neu'r awdurdodau lleol. A allwch chi jest ehangu ar hynny, jest er mwyn deall y cyd-destun pam maen nhw wedi dod i'r casgliad hynny?

[110] **Ms Evans:** Pan wnaethon ni'r gwaith maes, mi wnaethom ni ymweld ag ysgolion ledled Cymru, ac mewn ychydig o awdurdodau, nid oedd dim defnydd—wel, o'r ysgolion y gwnaethom ni ymweld â nhw, beth bynnag—nid oedd dim defnydd o'r asiantaethau, oherwydd barn bersonol y pennaeth. Hefyd mewn trafodaethau â'u cydbenaethiaid nhw, beth ddywedon nhw wrthym ni oedd nad oedden nhw'n awyddus i ddefnyddio asiantaethau a'i bod yn well gyda nhw gysylltu ag athrawon cyflenwi yn uniongyrchol trwy restr y sir neu gysylltu â phobl efallai sydd yn gyn-athrawon. Mae gyda nhw eu *pool* eu hunain, a dyna sut maen nhw'n gweithredu, oherwydd rhesymau penodol a barn benodol sydd gyda nhw efallai am asiantaethau.

[111] **Bethan Jenkins:** Y cwestiwn olaf gen i yw: os oes yna broblem gydag athro neu athrawes benodol o ran sut maen nhw'n trin plentyn ac mae yna gŵyn yn mynd yn eu herbyn nhw, beth yw'r profiad sydd gennych chi ynglŷn â hynny? Hynny yw, os mai athro yw e, mae yna broses disgyblu clir, ond rwy'n deall nad yw hynny'n digwydd yr un mor effeithiol o ran asiantaeth.

perhaps—that would be a possibility—or some sort of rules in terms of how much training a teacher would have to undertake in a certain period of time. There are various ways of dealing with this issue.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yes, because I did suggest, when we had a private session with the Wales Audit Office, that there could be some sort of points system that could benefit an individual, because what you said earlier was that a person working for an agency doesn't want to take time off, because they need the money to live, so I think we need a piece of work to look at the options for how we can help them through this process. Just in terms of whether you could give us a little more information about—. I don't think I heard anything on what I said at the beginning about some schools having an attitude of not using agencies, or local authorities. Can you just expand on that, just to help us to understand the context of why they came to that decision?

**Ms Evans:** When we undertook the fieldwork, we visited schools the length and breadth of Wales, and in a few authorities, in terms of the schools we visited, at least, there was no use made of the agencies. That was perhaps the personal decision of the headteacher. Also, in discussions with their fellow headteachers, what they said was that they weren't eager to use agencies, and that they preferred to contact supply teachers directly through the county list or to contact former teachers. They would have their own pool, and that was how they implemented this system, and that was for specific reasons and their personal opinions on agencies, perhaps.

**Bethan Jenkins:** My final question is: if there is a problem with a specific teacher in terms of how they treat a child and a complaint is made against them, what experience do you have about that? For example, if it's a teacher, there's a disciplinary process that's very clear, but I understand that that doesn't happen as effectively in terms of an agency.

10:30

[112] **Ms Evans:** Pan wnaethom ni ymweld ag ysgolion, rwy'n credu os oedd yna fater difrifol iawn yn codi, mi oedden nhw'n dilyn y drefn, ond ble'r oedden nhw'n gweld bod enghreifftiau—. Roedd pob math o enghreifftiau mewn ysgolion ynglŷn ag ymddygiad gan garfan fechan iawn o athrawon cyflenwi, ond roedd pob un o'r ysgolion yn gallu rhoi enghraifft i ni o sut yr oedden nhw wedi gorfod gofyn i rywun i adael ac i beidio â dod nôl i weithio yn yr ysgol. Yn yr achosion hynny, nid oeddent yn unrhyw beth digon difrifol i orfod cysylltu â GTCW, i fynd i lawr y trywydd yna, ond roeddent yn rhywbeth digon mawr i beri pryder iddyn nhw a theimlo nad oedden nhw'n moyn i'r person yna i ddod yn ôl i'r ysgol.

**Ms Evans:** When we visited schools, if there was a particularly grave issue, they would follow the system, but when they saw examples—. There were all sorts of examples in schools in terms of the behaviour of a very small cohort of supply teachers, but every school could give us an example of how they may have had to ask someone to leave and not return to that particular school. In those cases, they weren't sufficiently serious to have to contact GTCW, to go down that particular route, but it was a grave enough issue to cause concern and for the school to feel that they didn't want them back.

[113] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond, fe all yr asiantaeth jest eu danfon nhw i rywle arall, ac wedyn bydd neb yn gwybod unrhyw beth—bydden nhw *none the wiser* o ran beth sy'n digwydd gyda'r athro neu athrawes hynny.

**Bethan Jenkins:** But, the agency could just send them to elsewhere, and no-one would know anything—they'd be none the wiser about what had happened with that teacher.

[114] **Ms Evans:** O bosib.

**Ms Evans:** Well, that's certainly a possibility.

[115] **Mr Rowlands:** Nid os yw'n rhywbeth hollol ddifrifol fel *safeguarding*.

**Mr Rowlands:** Not if it's a very serious issue like *safeguarding*.

[116] **Bethan Jenkins:** Felly, byth os yw e'n rhywbeth difrifol iawn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** So, never if it's a very serious issue.

[117] **Mr Rowlands:** Wel, oni bai nad ydynt wedi dilyn y canllawiau. Nid oes gennym unrhyw fath o dystiolaeth o hynny'n digwydd.

**Mr Rowlands:** Well, only if they haven't followed the guidelines. We have no evidence that that has happened.

[118] **Ann Jones:** David and Aled, and then I think that'll be it, because we're just on time.

[119] **David Rees:** Just a quick couple of points. The serious circumstances I understand, but, clearly, there is some bad teaching and that could be passed elsewhere. As a consequence, should we be looking at regulating agencies, because, I've been talking to the trade unions, obviously, and they're concerned about it? Would regulation be one way of ensuring that agencies are actually able to be accountable for who they deliver, but also to be accountable, perhaps, for the quality of the people they employ?

[120] **Mr Rowlands:** Well, I think the short answer is 'yes'. It is a way of dealing with this issue.

[121] **David Rees:** The short answer's fine.

[122] **Ann Jones:** Yes.

[123] **Mr Rowlands:** It would cost money.

[124] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Aled and then I've got Keith, as well, because Keith was down to ask questions on this.

[125] **Aled Roberts:** Mi fydd y sefyllfa'n newid o fis Ebrill ymlaen, achos mae'r farchnad gymysg yma'n mynd i ddiplannu. Ni fydd yna restrau sirol, felly'r unig ddewis fydd gan bennaeth fydd un ai mynd yn uniongyrchol at athro cyflenwi neu athrawes gyflenwi, neu ddefnyddio asiantaeth. Roeddwn i'n synnu pan ddywedodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ystod eu tystiolaeth nhw fod y cytundeb fframwaith yma efo'r asiantaethau, neu efo un asiantaeth yng Nghymru, wedi cael ei drafod jest fel unrhyw gytundeb caffael o fewn llywodraeth leol. Nid oedd yna unrhyw fewnbwn addysgiadol. Nid oes sôn am ansawdd na dim byd; jest mater o bris ydy o.

**Aled Roberts:** The situation will change from April onwards, because this mixed market is going to disappear. There won't be any county lists, so the only option that a headteacher will have will be either to go directly to a supply teacher, or to use one of these agencies. I was surprised when the Wales Audit Office told us during their evidence that this framework agreement with the agencies, or with one agency in Wales, had been discussed just like any procurement agreement within local government. There had been no educational input. There was no talk of quality or anything of that nature; it was just a matter of price.

[126] Rwy'n deall bod yna gytundeb fframwaith newydd. A ydych chi wedi cael unrhyw fewnbwn, fel arolygaeth, i drafod materion o ran ansawdd, o ran adborth a phethau felly, i sicrhau bod y cytundeb fframwaith newydd yn well na'r un sydd wedi ein cael ni i mewn i'r fath sefyllfa â'r un presennol?

I understand that there's a new framework agreement. Have you had any input, as an inspectorate, to discuss issues in terms of quality, in terms of feedback and so forth, to ensure that this new framework agreement is a better one than the one that has got us into the current situation?

[127] **Mr Rowlands:** Na.

**Mr Rowlands:** No.

[128] **Ann Jones:** Keith.

[129] **Keith Davies:** Aled's just asked my question.

[130] **Ann Jones:** Right, okay. That's good. Well, thank you. That's it then. Can I thank you both for coming? You know that you'll get a copy of the transcript to check for accuracy, because it forms part of our report into this inquiry. So, can I thank you both very much for coming today?

10:33

### **Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to note**

[131] **Ann Jones:** We've got a paper to note, which is the summary of the outreach work that was done by the outreach team. So, if we could just note that and then it comes into the public domain and forms part of our evidence. Okay, so happy to note that.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42(ix) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o  
Weddill y Cyfarfod**  
**Motion under Standing Order 17.42(ix) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the  
Remainder of the Meeting**

*Cynnig:*

*y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(ix).*

*Motion:*

*the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(ix).*

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.  
Motion moved.*

[132] **Ann Jones:** I will now, under 17.42, resolve to meet for the rest of this meeting in private. Is that okay? Is everybody happy? Okay, thank you very much. There is nobody in the public gallery, anyway.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10:34.  
The public part of the meeting ended at 10:34.*